SPEAKING ORDER

Vide Director General of Police, Punjab, Office Order No. 1077-1114 /E-1(4) dated 12.02.2021, a Central Recruitment Board was constituted for the recruitment of Civilian Support Staff in Bureau of Investigation of Punjab Police.

2.   The Recruitment was completed as per the procedure prescribed in the Standing Order No. 05 and Advertisement No. 05, dated 17.08.2021. The Computer Based Test (CBT) for 9 posts of Civilian Support Staff of PBI was held on 21/22-09-2021 at six TCS iON centres at SAS Nagar, Bathinda, Patiala, Jalandhar and Amritsar. Out of 6894 registered candidates, 5585 candidates appeared in CBT; out of which 4255 candidates qualified in CBT. 1449 candidates category wise were shortlisted for Document Verification. The document verification process was conducted in two phases, first from 05.04.2022 to 09.04.2022 and in the second phase from 08.08.2022 to 09.08.2022.

3.   In view of the requirement of experience mentioned in the Advertisement as an eligibility criteria for selection against 9 posts advertised, a panel comprising of domain experts was constituted vide Order No. 3796/CR-E(1) dated 07.04.2022 by Director, BoI, Punjab for scrutiny of experience criterion. The Document Verification exercise involved scrutiny of eligibility criteria, including educational qualifications and experience. The exercise was carried out by teams comprising of Police officials and Domain experts selected from the Forensic Science Laboratory, Punjab, Department of Governance Reforms and Public Grievances, Punjab and Financial & Legal Experts from Bureau of Investigation.

4.   On completion of the Document Verification exercise, candidates not fulfilling the eligibility criterion were excluded from the consideration zone in preparation of the Provisional Merit list. The merit list of provisionally selected

candidates was uploaded on the recruitment portal on 02.11.2022. After the declaration of result, number of representations were received by the Board from non selected candidates pertaining to their non selection.

5.   Accordingly, a Sub-Committee was constituted, vide order No. 1088/Rect. Cell, dated 10.11.2022 to examine objections raised by the candidates to the provisional merit list of 9 categories of Civilian Support Staff in Bureau of Investigation, Punjab and put up a report to the Board.

6.   Meanwhile, petitioner Harshpreet Singh Jeffy and others (CWP No. 27099 of 2022), Lovepreet Kaur (CWP No. 27880 of 2022), Sursumel Singh (CWP No. 27884 of 2022), Vinod Agnihotri (CWP No. 27931 of 2022), Mandeep Kaur and other (CWP No. 27179 of 2022), Harsimran Kaur and others (CWP No. 27125 of 2022) and Mandeep Kaur (CWP No. 27614 of 2022), filed writ petitions in the Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court with the request for quashing the impugned provisional list of selected candidates for the posts of Information Technology Assistant (Software) in CWP Nos. 27614, 27099, 27179, 27884, Information Technology Officer in CWP 27931, Assistant Financial Officer in CWP 27125 and Forensic Officer in CWP No. 27880 of 2022 to the extent that the names of the petitioners do not find mention in the list despite being higher in merit than many selected candidates. Hon'ble High Court vide Orders dated 05.12.2022, had disposed of the above mentioned CWPs with the order reproduced as below: -

> "...Keeping in view of the fact that the entire matter is being re-looked into on the basis of representations that have already been preferred by the candidates and the Sub Committee constituted is to take up grievance of each applicant, let the writ petitions filed by the petitioner herein also be placed before the Sub Committee which would go into the issue and the grievance of the petitioners would also be considered and redressed by passing a speaking order, which order would be communicated to the candidate including the petitioners herein.
>
> Consequently, these writ petitioners are disposed of with the aforesaid directions.
>
> Since there is urgency in the said matter and recruitment process ought to be completed, let the Committee complete the entire process within a period of six weeks from today."

2

7.	In compliance of the above order, a speaking order in respect of non selection of candidates in 6 posts of Civilian Support Staff other than Computer Digital Forensic Officer, Information Technology Officer & Information Technology Assistant (Software) was uploaded on the recruitment portal on 20.01.2023. In respect of the balance 3 posts, an application was filed in the Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court for grant of additional time and the Hon'ble Punjab & Haryana High Court vide its order dated 06.02.2023, allowed four weeks time to complete the process.

8.	It is pertinent to mention that subsequent to receipt of representations and a preliminary examination of the contentions raised therein, a meeting of the Central Recruitment Board was convened wherein the domain experts from the Department of Governance Reforms proposed that wider meaning of relevant experience in the IT field was required to be taken whereby experience as Professor/Assistant Professor in colleges as well as proprietorship experience should not be excluded from the consideration zone.

9.	In view of the above expert opinion of the IT domain experts, the Recruitment Board, approved the proposal with a view to provide a fair chance to candidates with the requisite eligibility criterion and who also had a higher merit in the written examination. In view of the fact that there would be candidates with marks higher then cut off, who would also be required to be treated at par with other similarly situated candidates; in addition to the review of record of candidates who submitted representations to the Board, the domain experts would also review experience criterion submitted by all candidates who obtained higher marks than cut off.

10.	Accordingly, based on the recommendations of the Domain experts, the Sub-Committee has submitted a report of the Board wherein out of 106 representations received by the Board, 74 were rejected, while in 32 cases, Sub Committee has recommended that the cases may be reconsidered in light of expert comments. Furthermore, as a result of the comprehensive review of

3

experience criterion of all candidates with marks in written examination more than cut off marks, additional 26 cases were recommended for acceptance of experience. In addition, in 6 cases of Computer Digital Forensic Officer, 5 cases of Information Technology Officer and 11 cases of Information Technology Assistant (Software), the Sub-Committee, after review by domain experts and on their recommendations have recommended that the above said candidates may be placed out of the merit list on account of reasons mentioned in Annexures (H, I & J). Brief summary of change in the merit list has been provided below:

	I	II	III
A	Candidates who submitted representation to the Board.	No candidates whose representations were accepted.	Candidate whose representations have been rejected.
Information Technology Officer	13	5	8
Information Technology Assistant (Software)	85	27	58
Computer Digital Forensic Officer	8	--	8
B	Rejected candidates with marks more than cut off.	Number of candidates whose experience accepted on review	Number of candidates whose status remains rejected out of Column-I
Information Technology Officer	9	0	9
Information Technology Assistant (Software)	155	26	129
Computer Digital Forensic Officer	12	--	12
C	Number of selected candidates records reviewed	Number of candidates whose status remained unchanged as per provisional merit list published on 02.11.2022	Number of candidates who (on review) have been placed out of merit list on account of irrelevant experience.
Information Technology Officer	33	28	5
Information Technology Assistant (Software)	228	217	11
Computer Digital Forensic Officer	6	--	6

12.   The recommendations of the Sub-Committee have been duly deliberated in the meeting of the Central Recruitment Board held on 06.03.2023 and accepted. Accordingly, the revised Provisional Merit List has been prepared and is being published on the portal alongwith this Speaking Order.

Enclosures:

Annexure: D (pages 1-3)	Representations CDFO
Annexure E (pages 4-9)	Representation ITO
Annexure F (pages 10-47)	Representation ITA (Software)
Annexure G (pages 1-9)	Experience ITA (Software) accepted on review
Annexure H (pages 1-4)	Experience CDFO rejected on review
Annexure I (pages 5-7)	Experience ITO rejected on review
Annexure J (pages 8-13)	Experience ITA (Software) rejected on review

Gurpreet Deo, IPS
Spl. DGP CAD, Punjab
Chairperson,
Central Recruitment Board,
CSS, BoI, Punjab. 16/3/2023

5